Fungal Biology xxx (2018) 1-13



Contents lists available at ScienceDirect

Fungal Biology



journal homepage: www.elsevier.com/locate/funbio

Inheritance of phenotypic traits in the progeny of a *Ceratocystis* interspecific cross

Arista Fourie^a, Michael J. Wingfield^a, Brenda D. Wingfield^a, Magriet A. van der Nest^a, M. Theodor Loots^b, Irene Barnes^{a,*}

^a Department of Biochemistry, Genetics and Microbiology, Forestry and Agricultural Biotechnology Institute (FABI), University of Pretoria, Pretoria, 0002, South Africa

^b Department of Statistics, University of Pretoria, Pretoria, 0002, South Africa

ARTICLE INFO

Article history: Received 13 November 2017 Received in revised form 1 March 2018 Accepted 2 March 2018 Available online xxx

Corresponding Editor: Nicholas P Money

Keywords: Ceratocystis fimbriata Ceratocystis manginecans Heritability Host specificity Quantitative traits

ABSTRACT

Ceratocystis fimbriata is a fungal plant pathogen that causes black rot on *Ipomoea batatas*. Based on inoculation studies on numerous tree species, the pathogen is known to be host specific. The closely related species, *Ceratocystis manginecans*, causes severe wilt on a broad range of tree hosts, including *Mangifera indica, Acacia mangium* and other leguminous tree species. The genetic factors underlying the pathogenicity and host specificity of *Ceratocystis* species have rarely been investigated. In this study, an F₁ population of 70 recombinant progeny from a cross between *C. fimbriata* and *C. manginecans* was generated and the inheritance of various phenotypic traits was investigated. Results showed that colony colour, growth rate, asexual spore production and aggressiveness to *I. batatas* and *A. mangium* are all quantitative traits with high levels of heritability. However, conidia production and aggressiveness appeared to be regulated by a small number of genes. No correlation could be found between aggressiveness study to consider genetic inheritance of pathogenicity and host specificity in *Ceratocystis* species and the results will contribute, in future, to the identification of quantitative trait loci and candidate genes associated with the traits investigated.

© 2018 British Mycological Society. Published by Elsevier Ltd. All rights reserved.

1. Introduction

The effective control of fungal plant pathogens is dependent on our understanding of the biology and life history traits of the pathogen. In fungal plant pathogens, most traits associated with pathogenicity and host specificity are quantitative and thus regulated by multiple genes. Examples of such traits in fungi include mycotoxin production (Cumagun et al., 2004; Talas et al., 2016), melanisation (Lendenmann et al., 2014), mycelial/hyphal growth rate (De Vos et al., 2011; Lee et al., 2015), hyphal length (Lin et al., 2006) and spore production (Lannou, 2011; Milus et al., 2008). In some species, different mating types that differ in growth rate, have been shown to indirectly influence aggressiveness (Lee et al., 2015; Lin et al., 2006). However, to understand how these phenotypes are regulated, the genomic regions associated with each trait must be identified.

Sexual crosses between different strains or closely related species provide an effective approach to determine whether a trait is quantitative. This is achieved by investigating the segregation of traits in the progeny (Cumagun et al., 2004; Stewart and McDonald, 2014). In Ophiostoma ulmi, for example, fitness traits such as hostcolonising ability, toxin production and growth rate were all determined to be complex, based on the non-Mendelian segregation in the progeny arising from a sexual cross (Kile and Brasier, 1990). Interspecific crosses provide more divergent traits for comparison than intraspecific crosses and have been used to investigate the inheritance of traits associated with host specificity (De Vos et al., 2011; Lind et al., 2007; Olson et al., 2005). Although only established recently in fungi, quantitative studies have also been undertaken in natural populations, based on genome-wide association studies (GWAS), where genetic factors associated with virulence traits have been identified in several fungi (Dalman et al., 2013; Gao et al., 2016; Talas et al., 2016).

The genus *Ceratocystis* includes 36 species, most of which are plant pathogens (De Beer et al., 2014; Marin-Felix et al., 2017), that

* Corresponding author. E-mail address: irene.barnes@fabi.up.ac.za (I. Barnes).

https://doi.org/10.1016/j.funbio.2018.03.001

1878-6146/© 2018 British Mycological Society. Published by Elsevier Ltd. All rights reserved.

infect hosts such as forest and fruit trees (De Beer et al., 2014; Van Wyk et al., 2013) and various root crops (Harrington et al., 2014; Wingfield et al., 2013). Species in this genus infect their hosts through wounds, after which they occupy the xylem vessels that results in symptoms such as stem cankers, xylem staining, wilt and in many cases tree death (Van Wyk et al., 2013).

Knowledge of the factors associated with host specificity and aggressiveness in *Ceratocystis* species has been limited to studies focusing on host response during infection (Al-Sadi et al., 2010; Kojima and Uritani, 1976; Trang et al., 2017) and studies on enzymes produced by *Ceratocystis* for the breakdown of host phenolics (Wadke et al., 2016). A recent *Ceratocystis* genome comparison identified potential pathogenicity genes in *Ceratocystis cacaofunesta* and *Ceratocystis fimbriata*, including putative effectors and a highly expanded phosphatidylinositol-specific phospholipase-C gene family (Molano et al., 2018). This provides various candidates for future functional studies.

Host specificity has been demonstrated in a number of *Ceratocystis* species. For example, *C. cacaofunesta* is pathogenic only on *Theobroma cacao* and *C. platani* only on *Platanus* spp. (Baker et al., 2003; Tsopelas et al., 2017). Similarly, the type species of *Ceratocystis, C. fimbriata sensu stricto*, has been reported only to cause black rot of *Ipomoea batatas* (sweet potato) (Halsted, 1890). The host specificity of this species has been confirmed from inoculations on *T. cacao, Platanus* spp (Baker et al., 2003) and *Acacia mangium* trees (Rauf M.R., personal communication 2016).

Contrary to the host specific *C. fimbriata*, the closely related species, *Ceratocystis manginecans*, has a broader host range and has resulted in significant losses in *A. mangium* plantations (Brawner et al., 2015; Fourie et al., 2016; Tarigan et al., 2011) and *Mangifera indica* (mango) orchards (Al Adawi et al., 2006). Other reported hosts include *Eucalyptus* (Chen et al., 2013), *Punica granatum* (Harrington et al., 2014; Huang et al., 2003) and the leguminous trees, *Dalbergia sissoo* and *Prosopis cineraria* (Al Adawi et al., 2013). The pathogenicity of *C. manginecans* on *I. batatas* has not been determined.

C. fimbriata s.s. and *C. manginecans* are morphologically very similar but phylogenetically distinct species (Fourie et al., 2014). They can, however, be induced to mate in a controlled laboratory environment (Ferreira et al., 2010; Li et al., 2016; Oliveira et al., 2015b). Mating studies have been used extensively in the Ceratocystidaceae to understand mating systems and the inheritance of mating type genes (Kile et al., 1996; Webster and Butler, 1967), colony colour (Webster, 1967), mycelial phenotypes, cycloheximide resistance (Harrington and McNew, 1997) and microsatellite marker regions (Ferreira et al., 2010) within the family. This has established an ideal system to perform an interspecific cross that can be used to investigate the inheritance of other phenotypic traits in the progeny (De Vos et al., 2011; Lind et al., 2007).

Ceratocystis species are haploid and homothallic, with a unidirectional mating-type switching system that results in both selffertile (MAT2) and self-sterile (MAT1) progeny (Webster and Butler, 1967; Wilken et al., 2014; Witthuhn et al., 2000). In MAT1 isolates one of the three *MAT* genes (*MAT1-2-1*) is absent. These isolates are used in sexual crosses in combination with self-sterile MAT2 isolates (Engelbrecht and Harrington, 2005; Johnson et al., 2005). Isolates of the latter type have been produced only in laboratory conditions, they contain all three *MAT* genes but ascomata (sexual structures) and protoperithecia are absent, likely due to a mutation influencing protoperithecia formation (Ferreira et al., 2010; Webster, 1967).

The aim of this study was to perform an interspecific cross between an isolate of *C. manginecans* and *C. fimbriata* and to investigate the inheritance of traits associated with host specificity and aggressiveness in the progeny. For this purpose, the recombinant progeny from the cross were used to determine the frequency distribution and heritability of phenotypic traits. The primary trait investigated was lesion lengths induced on the respective plant hosts, *I. batatas* and *A. mangium*, after reciprocal inoculation. In addition, because colony pigmentation (Lendenmann et al., 2014), growth rate in culture (Zhan et al., 2016) and asexual spore production (Lannou, 2011) have been associated with aggressiveness in other fungal pathogens, these traits were also considered in the current study.

2. Materials and methods

2.1. Parental isolates

Three C. fimbriata s.s. isolates (CMW14799 from USA and CMW42704 and CMW42705 from Malaysia) and two C. manginecans isolates (CMW46461 and CMW48940 from Malaysia) were used for mating experiments between the two species (Table 1). The parental isolates were selected, based on their specific pathogenicity on *I. batatas* and *A. mangium*, respectively. Cultures were grown on 2 % malt extract agar (MEA), supplemented with 150 mg/L Streptomycin sulfate salt (Sigma–Aldrich, Germany) and 1 mg/L Thiamine hydrochloride (Sigma–Aldrich, Germany), at room temperature (22 °C) for 14 d.

2.2. Mating between C. fimbriata and C. manginecans to establish an F_1 population

For each parental isolate used in the study, both MAT1 and MAT2 self-sterile cultures were generated. MAT1 individuals were produced from the self-fertile MAT2 parental isolates by dispersing spores from a single ascospore drop on MEA media, using Soltrol® 130 isoparaffin solvent (Chevron Phillips Chemical Company LP, Texas, US) as described by Wilken et al. (2014). Germinating single ascospores were isolated and cultures failing to produce ascomata were selected. MAT2 self-sterile isolates were produced by continuous sub-culturing of aerial mycelia of MAT2 self-fertile isolates until no ascomata were produced. The presence/absence of the *MAT1-2-1* gene in the putative MAT1 and MAT2 self-sterile isolates were confirmed using the primers MAT-121F and

Table 1

Information on the host and location of Ceratocystis isolates used in this study.

Species	CMW no. ^a	CBS no. ^b	Host	Location	Collector and date collected
C. fimbriata	14799	CBS114723	Ipomoea batatas	North Carolina, USA	D. McNew, 1998
	42704		"	Malaysia	R. Rauf, 2014
	42705		"	Malaysia	R. Rauf, 2014
C. manginecans	46461	CBS143454	Acacia mangium	Sabah, Malaysia	R. Rauf, 2014
	48940		"	Malaysia	R. Rauf, 2014

^a Fungal culture collection at the Forestry and Agricultural Biotechnology Institute (FABI), University of Pretoria, South Africa. ^b Culture Collection (CBS) of Westerdijk Fungal Biodiversity Institute, Utrecht, The Netherlands.

A. Fourie et al. / Fungal Biology xxx (2018) 1-13

Table 2	
Mating success from the different mating types produced from the parental isolate	s.

Species	Isolate and mating type	C. manginecans	C. fimbriata	
		CMW46461 MAT2 self-sterile	CMW42705 MAT2 self-sterile	CMW14799 MAT2 self-sterile
C. manginecans	CMW46461 MAT1	N/A	Ascomata	Ascomata
	CMW48940 MAT1	N/A	Ascomata	Not performed
C. fimbriata	CMW42704 MAT1	No success	N/A	N/A
	CMW42705 MAT1	Ascomata	N/A	N/A
	CMW14799 MAT1	Ascomata	N/A	N/A

MAT-121R, following the PCR protocol as described by Wilken et al. (2014).

Interspecific crosses were performed by reciprocally crossing the MAT2 self-sterile and MAT1 isolate of each parent of C. fimbriata (CMW14799, CMW42704, CMW42705) and C. manginecans (CMW46461, CMW48940) with each other. MAT2 self-sterile mating types could only be produced for some isolates (CMW14799, CMW42705 and CMW46461) and thus in total, seven mating combinations were performed (Table 2). Crosses were performed by placing an agar plug of isolates of opposite species and opposite mating types on an MEA plate with a 2 cm distance between them. Each cross had 10 technical repeats. These plates were incubated for 2 weeks at room temperature (22 °C). Ascomata with creamy spore drops, produced in the hybrid zone between the two isolates, indicated a successful cross. Only the two parental isolates for which both self-sterile mating types (MAT1 and MAT2) were successfully generated and where the mating experiment worked reciprocally (CMW14799 and CMW46461), were selected for the production of the hybrid F₁ population.

To obtain the F₁ progeny from successful crosses, two to three drops of ascospore masses were lifted from the apices of ascomata formed in the hybrid zone and dispersed on MEA plates. After 24 h, a minimum of 100 germinating single spores were isolated and cultured from each reciprocal cross. Progeny isolates were labelled as MF if they were obtained from the *C. manginecans* (MAT2 self-sterile) and *C. fimbriata* (MAT1) cross and labelled as FM when obtained from the *C. fimbriata* (MAT2 self-sterile) and *C. manginecans* (MAT1) cross. All progeny isolates produced in this study are deposited in the culture collection (CMW) of the Forestry and Agricultural Biotechnology Institute (FABI), University of Pretoria (Table S1).

2.3. Fragment analyses to confirm recombinant progeny

To identify polymorphic microsatellite markers that could be used to screen for recombinant progeny, a set of 10 microsatellite markers, previously designed for C. manginecans (Fourie et al., 2016), were screened in the chosen parental isolates (CMW14799 and CMW46461). From the polymorphic markers identified, a subset of five were used for screening the 126 progeny obtained from the cross. DNA was obtained for each isolate using Chelex® 100 Molecular Biology Grade Resin (Bio-rad, California, USA). Mycelium was collected from the agar plates using a needle tip, then boiled in the Chelex resin for 30 min (100 °C) and centrifuged for 2 min at high speed. The supernatant was used for PCR reactions. The PCR amplification protocol was performed as described by Fourie et al. (2016), except that 3 µl Chelex extract containing DNA was used per reaction. Fragment analyses were performed using GeneScan, including a Liz500 (-250) size standard, on an ABI PRISM[™] 3500xl Autosequencer (Thermo Fisher Scientific, Carlsbad, USA). Alleles were scored using GeneMapper® v.4.1 (Applied Biosystems, Thermo Fisher Scientific, Carlsbad, USA), using the same protocol as described by Fourie et al. (2016).

A total of 70 isolates were selected for the F_1 population that included 35 recombinant individuals from each reciprocal cross. The segregation of all five microsatellite markers was investigated in the F_1 progeny by testing the deviation from a 1:1 mendelian segregation ratio, using a Chi-square test (p < 0.05).

2.4. Colony colour and growth rate in progeny isolates

To determine whether colony colour was a heritable trait, its segregation in the progeny was considered. The two parental isolates (*C. fimbriata* CMW14799 and *C. manginecans* CMW46461) differ in colony colour and the amount of aerial versus submerged mycelia when grown on MEA. *C. fimbriata* (CMW14799) had darker, more deeply olive green pigmentation than *C. manginecans* (CMW46461) and had significantly more fluffy, aerial mycelia. A representative colony for each of the parents and the 70 progeny, grown on MEA, was digitally photographed 14 d post inoculation (dpi) under controlled lighting, using an Epson Perfection[™] V700 Photo scanner. The images of all isolates were sorted into cate-gories, based on pigmentation, from light to dark.

The optimal growth temperature for the two parental isolates was determined by incubating the MAT2 self-fertile cultures at 20 °C, 25 °C and 30 °C on MEA. Additionally, to test whether nutrient acquisition might play a role in host specificity, the effect of host-specific plant extract media (*A. mangium* and *I. batatas*) on growth rate was tested for the two parental strains at the optimal growth temperature of 25 °C. The *A. mangium* extract agar (AEA) was obtained by boiling 110 g of plant material, and the *I. batatas* extract agar (IEA) by boiling 306 g of plant material in 1 L distilled water in an autoclave. The liquid extract was combined with 15 g agar, filled with water to a final volume of 1 L and autoclaved a second time. All media were supplemented with 150 mg/L Streptomycin sulfate salt.

Plate inoculations of the MAT2 self-fertile parental isolates were performed on all three media types (MEA, AEA and IEA). As only the MEA and AEA media resulted in a significant difference in growth rate between the two parental isolates at 25 °C, these were selected for further studies in the progeny. The growth rate of the MAT2 selfsterile and MAT1 parental isolates were also included with the progeny growth studies. Cultures used for the growth studies were incubated for 14 d on MEA after which 5 mm diameter agar plugs were transferred to 90 mm agar plates. Ten plates were inoculated per isolate and per media type and incubated for 12 d at 25 °C. Plates were marked with two perpendicular lines on which colony size was recorded every second day. The data points from both axes on a plate were used to determine the average growth rate (mm/ 2 d) per plate and per isolate on the different media types.

2.5. Conidial production

The cultures grown on MEA media for the growth rate studies were used to determine conidial spore concentrations, approximately three weeks after the plates have been inoculated. Spore

4

counts were performed for the self-fertile and self-sterile parental isolates (CMW14799 and CMW46461) as well as for all 70 progeny isolates. For each isolate, four mycelial agar plugs of 5 mm diameter were cut from a single plate, combined, and agitated in an Eppendorf tube with 500 μ l distilled water, using a vortex mixer. Five plates were counted per isolate. A haemocytometer was used to count the number of spores in a 10 ul spore suspension.

2.6. Pathogenicity screening on two host plants

Plant inoculations were undertaken with the parental isolates *C. fimbriata* (CMW14799) and *C. manginecans* (CMW46461), including the MAT2 self-fertile and MAT2 and MAT1 self-sterile isolates, and with the 70 progeny isolates. In this study we consider pathogenicity and aggressiveness to be distinct traits. Both pathogenicity toward a specific host (the ability to cause disease) and aggressiveness on the host (degree of pathogenicity) was investigated. An isolate was considered pathogenic, if it was able to produce a lesion on the host that was larger than the control. Aggressiveness was quantified by the length of the lesion induced on the host.

2.6.1. Inoculation trials on I. batatas

The sweet potato variety Blesbok was used in all inoculation experiments. Fourteen tubers were inoculated per isolate. Prior to inoculation, the tubers were surface disinfested with ethanol, washed with water and air-dried. Wounds were made, deeper than the cortex layer (\pm 5 mm), with a 5 mm diameter cork borer and 20 ul of inoculum, containing 1.5 × 10⁶ conidial cells/ml, was added. In cases where isolates did not produce conidia, mycelial agar plugs (5 mm) were used in the inoculation. Clean MEA plugs were used as a negative control. Inoculated wounds were sealed with Parafilm M® (Bemis, Oshkosh). Inoculated tubers were stored in a greenhouse at 25 °C, with 90 % humidity and direct external light was blocked with black plastic bags. After five weeks, two dimensions of the black rot lesions were measured, one along the length and one along the width of the surface of the tuber, to determine an average lesion size.

2.6.2. Inoculation trials on Acacia mangium

A. mangium seeds were germinated in a germination mix (Culterra, Johannesburg, South Africa), combined with potting soil, for up to 10 weeks. These were then transplanted into poly bags with potting soil, sand and 2:3:2 (22) fertilizer and grown for a further 12 m. The parental isolates (CMW14799 and CMW46461, MAT2 self-fertile, MAT1 and MAT2 self-sterile) and 70 progeny isolates were inoculated onto ten trees each and kept in a greenhouse at 28 °C. Trees of different sizes, ranging from 17.5 cm to 200.5 cm in height and 0.4 cm-1.4 cm in stem width were distributed equally among all the isolates in the inoculation experiment. Wounds were made on the stems, on the second internode from the bottom, using a 4 mm diameter cork borer. Mycelial agar plugs were used for inoculation after which wounds were sealed with Parafilm M® (Bemis, Oshkosh). Clean MEA agar plugs were used as negative controls. A fully randomised block design was used to store the trees during lesion development. Trees were maintained in a greenhouse at 28 °C for three weeks after which tree height and stem diameter as well as lesion lengths on the stems were measured for each tree. To obtain an accurate measurement of the lesion length, the bark and outer cortex layer of the stem were removed from the surface before measuring.

2.7. Inheritance of mating types in hybrid progeny

The mating type of all the progeny isolates was determined using primer sets Primer17/Primer25, to confirm the absence of the MAT1-2-1 gene and Primer17/Primer30 to confirm the presence of the gene (Wilken et al., 2014). Both primer sets amplify an intergenic region between the MAT1-1-1 and MAT1-1-2 genes but primer30 binds to a region that is removed along with the MAT1-2-1 gene and amplification is thus only possible if the gene is present. PCR reaction and amplification conditions were the same as that previously described for Ceratocystis (Wilken et al., 2014). Isolates lacking the MAT1-2-1 gene were classified as MAT1 and those containing the MAT1-2-1 gene, but not producing any ascomata, were classified as MAT2 self-sterile. To determine if the inheritance of the mating-types were consistent with a pattern of Mendelian inheritance, a Chi-square analysis (p < 0.05) was performed on the mating-types (self-fertile vs self-sterile) and for the inheritance of the MAT1-2-1 gene.

2.8. Statistical analyses

To construct a histogram of each trait, the frequency distribution among the progeny were calculated using the mean value of each individual for each trait. Traits included growth rate, conidial production, lesion length on *I. batatas* and lesion length on *A. mangium*. All subsequent analyses were performed in R version 3.3 (http:// www.r-project.org/; R Core Team, 2016). A Shapiro–Wilk test was performed to confirm whether the data deviates from a normal distribution. A student's t-test was performed to compare the growth rates of a single isolate on two different media.

To determine whether any of the progeny isolates were significantly different from the parents for the five traits considered, an analysis of variance (ANOVA) test was performed, using either the lsmeans package (Lenth, 2016) or agricolae (De Mendiburu, 2014). The Ismeans package was used for the host inoculation studies because the data included an unequal number of samples. Due to the unbalanced nature of the inoculation data, the type III error sum of squares from the car package (Fox and Weisberg, 2011) was used in the resulting ANOVA table. The null hypothesis assumed no differences between the means at a significance level of $\alpha = 0.05$.

Tukey's honestly significance difference (Tukey's HSD) test was performed on all data to determine which isolates differed significantly from each other and from the parental isolates (p-value = 0.05). A linear model was fitted to the data for the *A. mangium* inoculations in order to determine whether tree height or stem diameter influenced lesion length. Only the latter proved to contribute significantly, and an analysis of covariance (ANCOVA) model was subsequently used in comparing the means of all individuals by incorporating stem diameter as a continuous confounding variable.

To determine whether any of the phenotypic traits investigated in the progeny, including growth rate, conidial production and mating type (independent variables) are related to, or have an effect on lesion lengths on the host (two dependent variables), a multivariate analysis of covariance (MANCOVA) was performed. The average of each individual was calculated for each trait and these were used as dependent and independent variables. The analysis was performed using the car and Ismeans packages, based on a significance level of $\alpha = 0.05$. The Ismeans was used for the evaluation of multiple comparisons.

To investigate and visualise the relationship between all of the phenotypes considered (growth rate, spore production, pathogenicity to a specific host, colony colour and mating type), a multiple correspondence analysis (MCA) was performed in R, using the MCA function from the FactoMineR package (Lê et al., 2008). The first

two dimensions, explaining most of the variance, were plotted on a MCA plot. Since some of the variables were continuous and others were categorical, all continuous data were divided into categories based on the four quartiles of the data set. To determine whether the association between any two of the seven variables were significant, a Fisher's exact test was furthermore performed and p-values adjusted with the Bonferroni correction, in order to account for multiple testing. This was performed using the base functions p.adjust and fisher.test in R version 3.3 (http://www.r-project.org/; R Core Team, 2016).

Broad sense heritability (H^2) of growth rate, conidial production and aggressiveness on the two hosts was determined using the equation $H^2 = V_G/V_P$. The sum of square means (MS), determined from ANOVA analyses, were used to calculate the genotypic variance (V_G) and phenotypic variance (V_P) of a trait (Akaffou et al., 2012). V_P was equal to the MS between groups (MS_{BG}). The environmental variance (V_E) was based on the variation within the technical replicates of an isolate and this was equal to the MS within groups (MS_{WG}). To calculate V_G the formula used was $V_G =$ ($MS_{BG} - MS_{WG}$)/*n* for which *n* equals the number of repeats per individual. The values calculated for V_P and V_G were then used to calculate H^2 .

3. Results

3.1. Mating between C. fimbriata and C. manginecans to establish an F_1 population

MAT1 self-sterile isolates were obtained from all five potential parental isolates but MAT2 self-sterile isolates could only be produced for one C. manginecans (CMW46461) and two C. fimbriata (CMW14799, CMW42705) isolates. Therefore, the successfully obtained MAT2 self-sterile isolates (CMW14799, CMW42705, CMW46461) were crossed with all the MAT1 isolates of the opposite species (CMW14799, CMW42704, CMW42705, CMW46461, CMW48940) in all possible combinations (Table 2). Mating was not successful for all isolate combinations. The C. manginecans MAT2 self-sterile isolate (CMW46461) crossed successfully with two of the C. fimbriata MAT1 isolates (CMW14799 and CMW42705) but not with isolate CMW42704, suggesting this interspecific cross was not stable. Ascospore masses were also more watery than creamy in these crosses. The cross with CMW14799 MAT1 was selected for obtaining part of the F₁ population. For the reciprocal cross, both C. fimbriata MAT2 self-sterile isolates (CMW14799 and CMW42705) crossed successfully with the C. manginecans MAT1 isolate (CMW46461; Fig. 1), producing creamy ascospore drops. The cross with CMW14799 MAT2 self-sterile, however, produced the most viable and fertile progeny and was, therefore, selected for producing the other part of the F_1 population.

3.2. Fragment analyses to confirm recombinant progeny

All ten microsatellite markers tested in the parental isolates were polymorphic for the two species (Table S2). A subset of five markers (AF2, AF4, AF6, AF7 and AF9), that could be amplified in two PCR multiplex reactions, were selected for screening of the progeny isolates. From a total of 126 screened progeny isolates, 70 were single spore recombinant, 15 displayed double peaks at one to four of the markers and 41 were non-recombinant, representing either of the two parental genotypes. The 15 isolates with double peaks could be a mixed culture of two spores that only differ at some of the markers. Alternatively, this could be due to aneuploidy of some parental chromosomes, both present in a single isolate (Harrington and McNew, 1998). Four of the five microsatellite markers segregated in a 1:1 ratio (X^2 -value = 3.2, p-value = 0.05).



Fig. 1. Ascomata (a) with ascospore drops (b), obtained from the interspecific cross between *C. fimbriata* (MAT1), on the left, and *C. manginecans* (MAT2 self-sterile), on the right.

Marker AF4 deviated significantly from a 1:1 ratio, with 78 % of the progeny containing the *C. fimbriata* allele, suggesting a bias in the inheritance of some parts of the *C. fimbriata* genome. A BLAST analysis to the *C. fimbriata* genome (GenBank APWK03000000) showed that marker AF4 is in the coding region of a probable sucrose utilization protein (SUC1), which could have influenced the inheritance of this genomic region.

3.3. Colony colour and growth rate in progeny isolates

The mycelium of the C. fimbriata parent (CMW14799) was a very dark olive green and that of the C. manginecans parent (CMW46461) was a lighter olive. The colour of the MAT1 isolates of both species was similar to that of the C. manginecans parent, the MAT2 self-sterile of C. fimbriata was cream coloured, and that of C. manginecans was olive but lighter than the MAT1 isolate. The colony colour of the progeny varied significantly from the parents and among isolates (Fig. 2). Colour pigmentation showed a continuum from white to dark olive in the progeny. For descriptive purposes these could be classified into eight categories. These included white, off-white, light cream, cream, light olive, olive, darker olive and very dark olive (Fig. 3). The frequencies of these eight colour categories showed a bimodal distribution for the progeny isolates (Fig. S1A). Where the isolates were categorised broadly into light and dark colours, the ratio was 33:37 respectively. Although it resembles a 1:1 ratio, colony pigmentation is likely a quantitative trait, due to the range of colours observed. A significant association was, however, observed between light isolates and loss of pathogenicity (Fisher's exact test, p-value = 0.01; Fig. S2, Table S3). In addition, since 96 % of the pathogenic isolates were either olive or dark olive in colour (Table S4), a darker pigmentation might be associated with aggressiveness.

Both parental isolates grew optimally at 25 °C on MEA media and this temperature was used for all subsequent growth studies. *C. manginecans* grew most rapidly on IEA (10.1 mm/2 d) and AEA (8,4 mm/2 d) but less so on MEA (7,7 mm/2 d) (p-value < 0.05). The same tendency of preference for a specific media type was observed in the self-sterile *C. manginecans* isolates, although they grew faster than the self-fertile parent (Table S4). This suggests that the *C. manginecans* isolate's growth is improved by the nutrients provided by AEA, compared to MEA. In contrast, *C. fimbriata* did not have optimal growth on AEA but grew more slowly (7.8 mm/2 d) than on MEA (9.4 mm/2 d) (p-value < 0.05). The *C. fimbriata* MAT2





Fig. 2. Data distribution of the phenotypic traits in the 70 progeny from an interspecific cross. Aggressiveness toward *A. mangium* and *I. batatas*, measured as lesion length in mm, are indicated for each isolate, including the MAT2 self-fertile parental isolates. The average conidia spore count is indicated as grey dots. Isolates that grew significantly faster on one of the two media types (Student's t-test, $\alpha = 0.05$) are highlighted in green and yellow. Colony colour was coded from light to dark (1–8) and indicated underneath the label of each isolate. (For interpretation of the references to colour in this figure legend, the reader is referred to the Web version of this article.)

Α

Fourie et al. / Fungal Biology xxx (2018) 1-13

A. Fourie et al. / Fungal Biology xxx (2018) 1–13



Fig. 3. Illustration of all eight categories of colony pigmentation observed in progeny culture morphology. Colours ranged from (A) white, (B) off-white, (C) light cream, (D) dark cream, (E) light olive, (F) olive, (G) darker olive and (H) very dark olive. (For interpretation of the references to colour in this figure legend, the reader is referred to the Web version of this article.)



Fig. 4. Box and whisker plot representing the growth rates of the *C. fimbriata* and *C. manginecans* parental isolates on all three media types investigated (MEA (orange), AEA (blue) and IEA (grey)). Letters indicate Tukey HSD test results (p = 0.05) and any datasets with the same letter are not significantly different from each other. (For interpretation of the references to colour in this figure legend, the reader is referred to the Web version of this article.)

self-sterile isolate grew significantly slower than the MAT2 selffertile and MAT1 isolate (Table S4). There was a significant difference in growth rate between the two parents on all three media types (Fig. 4) but on MEA and IEA, *C. fimbriata* grew more rapidly while *C. manginecans* grew more rapidly on AEA and IEA. The significant increase in growth rate for *C. manginecans* and, in contrast, a reduction in growth rate for *C. fimbriata* on the AEA medium led to the choice of this medium, in addition to MEA, to test the growth of the progeny isolates. Based on the average growth rate for each isolate, the progeny approached a normal

distribution for growth both on MEA and AEA (Fig. S1), although this was not significant (Shapiro–Wilk test). For the broad-sense heritability, on both MEA and AEA media, high heritability values of $H^2 = 0.935$ (Table S5A) and $H^2 = 0.835$ (Table S5B), respectively, suggested a large genetic contribution to variation in growth rate. The MANCOVA analyses indicated no correlation between growth rate and aggressiveness on the host. Growth rate also did not show an association with any of the other phenotypes based on the MCA and Fisher's analyses (Fig. S2, Table S3).

Compared to the parental isolates, 46 of the 70 progeny isolates had a different growth rate on MEA than the *C. fimbriata* parent and 55 of the progeny differed from the *C. manginecans* parent (pvalue < 0.05) (Table 3). On AEA, 61 isolates had a different growth rate than the *C. fimbriata* parent and 52 isolates differed in growth rate from *C. manginecans* (p-value < 0.05). Comparison of growth rates of each progeny isolate on the two media types showed that 35 isolates grew more rapidly on AEA than on MEA, 16 grew more slowly on AEA than on MEA and 19 isolates did not show any difference in growth on the two different media types (Fig. 5).

3.4. Conidial production

The MAT2 self-fertile and MAT1 parental isolates did not differ from each other in the quantity of conidia produced (Table S4). The self-fertile *C. fimbriata* isolate produced 3.25×10^6 spores/ml and the MAT1 isolate 2.615×10^6 spores/ml. In the case of *C. manginecans* the self-fertile isolate produced 3.346×10^6 spores/ ml and the MAT1 isolate 4.865×10^6 spores/ml. The MAT2 selfsterile parental isolates (*C. fimbriata* and *C. manginecans*), however, produced significantly fewer conidia at concentrations of 7.5×10^4 and 9.8×10^5 spores/ml, respectively.

The conidial production data for the progeny isolates was not normally distributed (Fig. S1F). This suggests a single or limited number of genes are involved in determining this trait. The progeny isolates varied significantly from one another and from the parents in conidial concentration (Table S4; Fig. 2), ranging from 1.2×10^5 to 6.455×10^6 spores/ml. Forty seven progeny isolates produced few or no conidia. Two isolates produced greater numbers of conidia than the parental isolates, one of which was MAT2 self-fertile and one MAT1. The standard deviation was high for some of the isolates and an additional five technical repeats were included for those isolates to obtain a reliable average value. The broad-sense heritability of conidial production was $H^2 = 0.764$ (Table S5C), suggesting a high genetic contribution to this trait. There was no correlation between conidial production and any of the other phenotypic traits.

3.5. Pathogenicity screening on two host plants

3.5.1. Inoculations on I. batatas

The results of inoculations on *I. batatas* confirmed that *C. manginecans* is pathogenic to *A. mangium* but not to *I. batatas*. There was no significant difference between the lesion length induced by *C. manginecans* and the control (avg. 5.5 mm), while the lesions induced by *C. fimbriata* were significantly larger (avg. 33.5 mm) (Fig. S3). The MAT2 self-sterile strain of *C. fimbriata* was equally pathogenic on *I. batatas* than the self-fertile parent ($\alpha = 0.05$) and the MAT1 displayed slightly higher levels of aggressiveness (Fig. S4). Progeny isolates were considered pathogenic to *I. batatas* if they induced a lesion size larger than the control. The inheritance of pathogenicity to *I. batatas* in the progeny resembled a simple mendelian trait associated with two genes, with the ratio of non-pathogenic to pathogenic isolates being 54:16, close to a 3:1 ratio.

The aggressiveness of the 16 pathogenic and 54 non-pathogenic isolates was assessed by the lesion length induced on I. batatas. None of the progeny isolates were more aggressive than the parental C. fimbriata isolate. Four isolates were equally aggressive and the remaining isolates were all less aggressive than the C. fimbriata parental isolate (Fig. 2). The lesion length data displayed a continuous distribution but the frequency distribution was not normally distributed and was skewed toward lower aggressiveness (Fig. S1D). Aggressiveness thus resembled a quantitative trait in the progeny but the data distribution suggested the involvement of only a small number of genes. When the 16 pathogenic isolates were considered separately, no clear distribution of data was observed but it represented three data intervals (Fig. S1D). Thus, some of the pathogenic isolates displayed a low level of aggressiveness, some an intermediate and some high levels of aggressiveness. This distribution of the data further supports the involvement of a small number of genes in aggressiveness. The broad sense heritability for aggressiveness on I. batatas indicated a high level of genetic contribution to the variation observed $(H^2 = 0.832; Table S5D).$

3.5.2. Inoculations on Acacia mangium

Inoculation of the *C. fimbriata* parental isolate on *A. mangium* showed that the species is not pathogenic to this host, as the induced lesion lengths were similar to the control (avg. 25 mm). In contrast, lesion lengths arising from inoculation with *C. manginecans* were large (avg. 207.6 mm) and significantly longer than those induced by *C. fimbriata*. In two cases small lesions were produced on the trees inoculated with *C. fimbriata* but, statistically, the average lesion size produced by this isolate was not

Table 3

Comparison of growth rate, colony colour, aggressiveness and conidia production between the 70 progeny isolates and the two parental isolates.

Phenotype	Data distribution ^a	Heritability	No. of progeny different from C. manginecans ^b	No. of progeny different from <i>C. fimbriata</i> ^b
MEA ^c medium	Normal	0.935	50 faster	19 faster
			5 slower	27 slower
AEA ^d medium	Normal	0.835	47 faster	57 faster
			5 slower	4 slower
Colony colour	Bimodal	_	63 lighter	50 lighter
				9 darker
Aggressiveness on A. mangium	Continuous, skewed right	0.51	70 less aggressive	11 (different from control)
Aggressiveness on I. batatas	Continuous, skewed right	0.832	16 more aggressive	4 equally aggressive
				66 less aggressive
Conidia production	Continuous, skewed right	0.764	2 higher concentration	2 higher concentration
			47 lower concentration/no spores	47 lower concentration/no spores

^a Normality was tested with Shapiro–Wilk, at a significance level of 0.05.

^b Differences based on Tukey HSD at a significance level of 0.05 by comparison to the MAT2 self-fertile parental isolate data.

^c Malt extract agar.

^d Acacia mangium extract agar.

A. Fourie et al. / Fungal Biology xxx (2018) 1-13



Box and whisker plot representing the growth rates of the parents, C. fimbriata and C. manginecans, and all 70 progeny both on MEA (orange) and AEA media (blue). ċ. Fig.

significantly different from that of the control (Fig. S5). Comparison between the self-fertile and self-sterile *C. manginecans* isolates showed that the MAT1 has a similar level of aggressiveness on *A. mangium* than that of the self-fertile parent ($\alpha = 0.05$). In contrast, the MAT2 self-sterile had a significantly lower level of aggressiveness (Fig. S6). The inheritance ratio in the progeny isolates of non-pathogenic to pathogenic was 5:1, suggesting the involvement of three to four genes in determining the pathogenicity of the isolates.

Similar to the situation with the I. batatas inoculations, aggressiveness of the progeny on A. mangium resembled a quantitative trait. This was evident where the data showed a continuous distribution, although the frequency distribution was skewed towards lower aggressiveness (Fig. S1E). A correlation analysis between tree height, stem diameter and lesion length showed that tree stem diameter has an influence on lesion length and this was adjusted for before comparisons were made between progeny isolates. None of the progeny isolates were as aggressive on A. mangium as the C. manginecans parent. Eleven of the progeny isolates were considered pathogenic as they produced lesion lengths significantly different from the control, although not significantly different from C. fimbriata (Fig. 2). The data for these pathogenic isolates displayed a frequency distribution that approached a normal curve (Fig. S1E). This suggests that a larger number of genes might be involved in determining aggressiveness on A. mangium.

The broad sense heritability of aggressiveness on *A. mangium* was not as high as that on *I. batatas* with a value of $H^2 = 0.51$ (Table S5D), although this can still be considered a significant genetic contribution. The lower value suggests that environmental variables, such as tree size variation and growth conditions, could have had some influence on the variation observed.

3.6. Inheritance of mating types

Only 12 of the 70 progeny isolates were MAT2 self-fertile and produced ascomata. This was much lower than the number of self-sterile isolates (58) arising from the cross. Of the 58 self-sterile isolates, 19 were of the MAT2 self-sterile mating type (containing the *MAT1-2-1* gene) and 39 were MAT1. The ratio of self-fertile : self-sterile was 1:3 (p < 0.05) and not 1:1 as expected for a single mendelian trait. This confirms the involvement of a second gene in determining the phenotype, as suggested in previous studies (Webster, 1967). Based on the MANCOVA analyses, the mating type of the isolates did not have an effect on the conidia production, growth rate or aggressiveness of the isolate. There was, however, a significant association between mating type and colony colour (Fischer's exact test, p = 0.01, Table S3), as the lightly coloured isolates were all self-sterile (MAT1 or MAT2).

4. Discussion

In this study an interspecific cross between *C. fimbriata* and *C. manginecans* was successfully obtained in artificial laboratory conditions, allowing for the first study on the inheritance of pathogenicity and host specificity in recombinant progeny in *Ceratocystis*. By investigating the segregation of various traits in the F₁ progeny isolates we confirmed that colony pigmentation, conidia production, growth rate on MEA and AEA media and aggressiveness on *A. mangium* and *I. batatas* are quantitative traits with high heritability. Conidia production did not show a normal frequency distribution in the progeny and, although polygenic, is likely regulated by a small number of genes. Skewed frequency distributions were also observed for aggressiveness toward *A. mangium* and *I. batatas*, suggesting the association with a small number of genes.

During the mating experiments, not all isolate combinations of the attempted reciprocal crosses were equally successful, and some resulted in watery ascospore masses. This was also observed in other crosses between *Ceratocystis* isolates from different hosts, when *C. fimbriata* was used as the MAT1 partner (Engelbrecht and Harrington, 2005; Ferreira et al., 2010). The lower success of the crosses could either be due to partial species barriers or influenced by the mating type of the isolate (Ferreira et al., 2010). Nonetheless, there was also a higher than expected number of individuals that displayed no recombination in the five SSR markers (41 of the 126 screened progeny) and one SSR maker (AF4) displayed segregation distortion. This suggests some bias in the inheritance of parental genetic material or possibly the presence of lethal isolates in the offspring produced.

Based on a biological species concept, some researchers consider *C. fimbriata* and *C. manginecans* to be the same species (Li et al., 2016; Oliveira et al., 2015b), whereas a phylogenetic species concept supports treating these species as distinct taxa (Fourie et al., 2014). The biological species boundary *C. fimbriata* and *C. manginecans* did not appear to be complete at a pre-zygotic stage but rather post-zygotic, influencing the viability and fertility of the progeny. This result is similar to that shown in an experimental cross between *C. fimbriata* and *C. eucalypticola* (Wilken, 2015), between species in the closely related genus *Endoconidiophora* (Harrington and McNew, 1998) and in other fungal interspecific crosses (Kao et al., 2010) as discussed by Stukenbrock et al. (2013).

A 1:3 ratio of self-fertile to self-sterile progeny was observed in the F₁ population from the interspecific cross. This is similar to that observed for intraspecific crosses between MAT1 and MAT2 selfsterile isolates of *E. coerulescens* (Harrington and McNew, 1997) and interspecific crosses between *C. fimbriata* and *C. eucalypticola* (Wilken, 2015). This ratio suggests that two genes, inherited independently, are involved in ascomatal formation. The mutation of an additional gene, likely involved in protoperithecia development (Ferreira et al., 2010; Webster, 1967), resulted in the sterility of the MAT2 self-sterile parent, and this was inherited along with the MAT locus in the offspring. Even though the self-fertile : self-sterile ratio deviated from a 1:1 ratio, the *MAT1-2-1* gene was inherited in a 1:1 ratio, suggesting no bias in the inheritance of the mating type locus.

The restricted host ranges of *C. fimbriata* and *C. manginecans* was confirmed in this study. As previously shown with cross inoculations on various other tree species (Baker et al., 2003), *C. fimbriata* from *I. batatas* is not pathogenic to tree species, including *A. mangium*. It is well known that *C. manginecans* is not specific to a particular tree host as isolates from mango can also infect, for example, *Schinus terebinthifolius* (Harrington et al., 2011), *Dalbergia sissoo* and *Prosopis cineraria* trees (Al Adawi et al., 2013). However, the present study showed that *C. manginecans* from *A. mangium* is also not pathogenic to the root crop *I. batatas*. Inoculation studies on *I. batatas*, using other *Ceratocystis s.I.* strains from hosts such as coffee, prune, cacao, oak, taro and almond, also demonstrated a lack of pathogenicity on this host (Kojima and Uritani, 1976).

The restricted host ranges of the investigated *Ceratocystis* species are not regulated by a single gene. When the progeny isolates, obtained from the interspecific cross, were inoculated onto *I. batatas* and *A. mangium* the inheritance of pathogenicity in the progeny deviated significantly from a 1:1 segregation of pathogenic vs non-pathogenic. The inheritance ratio observed for pathogenicity toward *I. batatas* (3:1) and *A. mangium* (5:1) suggests that a small number of genes are associated with determining their host range. Three individuals displayed pathogenicity to both hosts. This might indicate that the isolates either gained genes from the one parent, which enabled it to infect both hosts, or lost a gene that

allowed it to evade host detection. The low number of genes associated with host specificity are consistent with what has been observed in similar studies on other fungal pathogens. For example, in an F₁ generation of *Magnaporthe oryzae*, generated from a cross between a wheat specific and rice specific parent, the inheritance ratio was consistent with three genes controlling host specificity (Tosa et al., 2006). Similar results were found for the related pathogen *Magnaporthe grisea* that infects rice (Murakami et al. 2000, 2003) and for the brown mustard plant pathogen *Leptosphaeria maculans* (Chen et al., 1996). Since a low number of genes are likely involved in host specificity in *Ceratocystis* species, pathogen host interaction genes, such as avirulence or effector genes might play a role (Deng et al., 2017; Molano et al., 2018; Shirke et al., 2016) but would need further investigation.

Inoculation of the F_1 progeny isolates onto *I. batatas* and *A. mangium* showed that aggressiveness in *Ceratocystis* is a quantitative trait. This was reflected by a continuous distribution of lesion lengths induced by the progeny isolates on both plant hosts. The frequency distribution of the lesion lengths of the isolates pathogenic on *I. batatas* did not display a distinct distribution but three categories of increased aggressiveness were observed. This suggests the involvement of a small number of genes having a strong effect. Similarly, in a cross between two *Fusarium* species, both pathogenicity and aggressiveness was suggested to be associated with only a small number of genes (Cumagun et al., 2004). On *A. mangium* the pathogenic isolates displayed a normal distribution in aggressiveness and, in this case, it is likely that a greater number of genes are involved in determining aggressiveness on this host.

The differences in growth rate of C. manginecans and C. fimbriata on three different media suggests that these species differ in their ability to obtain nutrients from their respective hosts. Nutrient processing differences have been associated with host specificity in other fungal pathogens (Brunner et al., 2013; Van der Nest et al., 2015). The reduced growth rate of C. fimbriata on AEA could suggest that the tree plant nutrients were more accessible to *C. manginecans* than to *C. fimbriata*. This could be due to differences in degradative enzymes (Van den Brink and de Vries, 2011). The fact that both species grew most rapidly on IEA suggests the simple sugars and starch from I. batatas (Ishida et al., 2000) were accessible and conducive for growth. Nutrient acquisition is unlikely to be the major factor determining host specificity in the Ceratocystis species, as the progeny pathogenic to I. batatas did not all display a slower growth rate on AEA. What was not tested on growth media, but could be an additional factor influencing host specificity, is the ability of the pathogen to process host response chemicals such as phenolics and terpenoids (Wadke et al., 2016). This should be investigated in future.

Growth rate was confirmed to be a quantitative trait in *C. fimbriata* and *C. manginecans.* This was evident from the continuous distribution and normal frequency distribution of the progeny growth rates both on MEA and AEA media. These results are similar to those for other filamentous fungi (De Vos et al., 2011; Van der Nest et al., 2009; Zhan et al., 2016). The genetic contribution to the regulation of growth rate was confirmed by the high broad-sense heritability values ($H^2 = 0.935$ and $H^2 = 0.835$). Although the *in vitro* growth rate of fungal pathogens has been associated with aggressiveness in several fungal species (Lee et al., 2015; Zhan et al., 2016), no clear correlation was observed in the isolates from this study. Similar results were found for *Ceratocystis* species pathogenic to *Eucalyptus* spp. (Oliveira et al., 2015a). Results of the present study indicate that aggressiveness and growth rate are traits regulated independently of each other.

The growth rate of an isolate could not be linked to a specific mating type in this study. The MAT1 mating type of

C. manginecans grew more slowly than the MAT2 self-fertile isolate, which is similar to observations seen in *Ceratocystis albifundus* (Lee et al., 2015). However, this trend was not observed for *C. fimbriata* where the MAT1 isolate was similar in growth rate to the MAT2 self-fertile isolate. In the case of the MAT2 self-sterile isolates, for which growth rate has never previously been investigated in *Ceratocystis*, the *C. fimbriata* MAT2 self-sterile isolate had a lower growth rate while in *C. manginecans* the growth rate did not differ from the MAT1 isolate. The mating type of a fungal species has been shown to be linked to growth rate in the yeast species *Cryptococcus neoformans* (Lin et al., 2006) and filamentous ascomycetes such as *C. albifundus* (Lee et al., 2015). However, in the present study the parents and F₁ progeny did not reflect a strong correlation between growth rate and a specific mating type.

Conidial production was shown to be a quantitative trait in *Ceratocystis*, most likely regulated by a few genes. This was evident from the continuous distribution of the phenotype in the progeny, ranging from sparse to abundant, and the non-normal frequency distribution observed. Although spore production has been linked to aggressiveness in some fungal species (Lannou, 2011; Milus et al., 2008), studies in two different wheat pathogens have found an independent regulation of spore production and lesion size induced on the host (Pariaud et al., 2009; Stewart et al., 2016). For the *Ceratocystis* species in the present study, no correlation was observed between these two traits. For example, one of the progeny isolates most aggressive to *A. mangium* (isolate FM-56D) produced very few conidia (Fig. 4). This lack of correlation has also been observed for *Ceratocystis* species pathogenic to *Eucalyptus* spp. in Brazil (Oliveira et al., 2015a).

The C. fimbriata and C. manginecans parents and the F₁ progeny displayed a continuous variation in colony pigmentation, from light to dark. This continuous variation suggests that melanin production is a quantitative trait in Ceratocystis. This is in contrast to a previous inheritance study with Ceratocystis sensu lato isolates, which suggested the involvement of a single gene in colony and ascomatal pigmentation (Webster, 1967). Melanin production, which influences colony pigmentation, has also been confirmed as a quantitative trait in other fungi (Butler and Day, 1998; Langfelder et al., 2003). In *Zymoseptoria tritici*, for example, up to 16 putative genes were linked to this trait (Lendenmann et al., 2014). Melanin has also been strongly associated with virulence (Collemare et al., 2008; Langfelder et al., 2003). The correspondence between a lighter pigmentation and a lack of pathogenicity observed in the progeny in this study, suggests that melanin could play a role in the pathogenicity of Ceratocystis species. The lower fitness of white isolates has also been observed in other species of the Ceratocystidaceae (Van Wyk et al., 2004).

Numerous mating studies have been performed with species residing in the Ceratocystidaceae, where the inheritance of mating genes, other culture morphological traits and genetic markers have been considered (Ferreira et al., 2010; Harrington and McNew, 1997, 1998; Johnson et al., 2005). The current study presents the first study considering the inheritance of host specificity and aggressiveness, using an F₁ population, for any species in this family. Results showed a high level of heritability and a quantitative nature of traits such as colony pigmentation, growth rate, conidial production, isolate aggressiveness and host specificity. The fact that a high level of aggressiveness in the pathogenic progeny could not be correlated with other life history traits such as mating type, growth rate and conidial production, suggests that aggressiveness is inherited independently of the other traits. The hybrid population produced in this study provides a valuable resource for future studies to identify the genomic regions associated with the traits investigated in this study.

12

A. Fourie et al. / Fungal Biology xxx (2018) 1-13

Acknowledgments

Financial assistance for this work was provided by members of the Tree Protection Co-operative programme (TPCP) at the Forestry and Agricultural Biotechnology Institute (FABI), University of Pretoria as well as the National Research Foundation (NRF) (Grant UID: 89619). Sandra Barnes and Kayla Josef are thanked for their assistance in testing the susceptibility of the sweet potato varieties to *C. fimbriata* as well as numerous students from the Tree Protection Co-operative Program (TPCP) at FABI that assisted in the plant inoculation studies.

Appendix A. Supplementary data

Supplementary data related to this article can be found at https://doi.org/10.1016/j.funbio.2018.03.001.

References

- Akaffou, D.S., Hamon, P., Doulbeau, S., Keli, J., Legnate, H., Campa, C., Hamon, S., de Kochko, A., Zoro, B.I.A., 2012. Inheritance and relationship between key agronomic and quality traits in an interspecific cross between *Coffea pseudozanguebariae* Bridson and *C. canephora* Pierre. Tree Genet. Genomes 8, 1149–1162.
- Al-Sadi, A.M., Al-Ouweisi, F.A., Al-Shariani, N.K., Al-Adawi, A.O., Kaplan, E.J., Deadman, M.L., 2010. Histological changes in mango seedlings following infection with *Ceratocystis manginecans*, the cause of mango decline. J. Phytopathol. 158, 738–743.
- Al Adawi, A.O., Barnes, I., Khan, I.A., Al Subhi, A.M., Al Jahwari, A.A., Deadman, M.L., Wingfield, B.D., Wingfield, M.J., 2013. *Ceratocystis manginecans* associated with a serious wilt disease of two native legume trees in Oman and Pakistan. Australas. Plant Pathol. 42, 179–193.
- Al Adawi, A.O., Deadman, M.L., Al Rawahi, A.K., Al Maqbali, Y.M., Al Jahwari, A.A., Al Saadi, B.A., Al Amri, I.S., Wingfield, M.J., 2006. Aetiology and causal agents of mango sudden decline disease in the Sultanate of Oman. Eur. J. Plant Pathol. 116, 247–254.
- Baker, C.J., Harrington, T.C., Krauss, U., Alfenas, A.C., 2003. Genetic variability and host specialization in the Latin American clade of *Ceratocystis fimbriata*. Phytopathology 93, 1274–1284.
- Brawner, J., Japarudin, Y., Lapammu, M., Rauf, R., Boden, D., Wingfield, M.J., 2015. Evaluating the inheritance of *Ceratocystis acaciivora* symptom expression in a diverse *Acacia mangium* breeding population. South. For. 77, 83–90.
- Brunner, P.C., Torriani, S.F.F., Croll, D., Stukenbrock, E.H., McDonald, B.A., 2013. Coevolution and life cycle specialization of plant cell wall degrading enzymes in a hemibiotrophic pathogen. Mol. Biol. Evol. 30, 1337–1347.

Butler, M., Day, A., 1998. Fungal melanins: a review. Can. J. Microbiol. 44, 1115–1136.

- Chen, C.Y., Plummer, K.M., Howlett, B.J., 1996. Ability of a Leptosphaeria maculans isolate to form stem cankers on Indian mustard (*Brassica juncea*) segregates as a single locus. Eur. J. Plant Pathol. 102, 349–352.
 Chen, S., Van Wyk, M., Roux, J., Wingfield, M.J., Xie, Y., Zhou, X., 2013. Taxonomy and
- Chen, S., Van Wyk, M., Roux, J., Wingfield, M.J., Xie, Y., Zhou, X., 2013. Taxonomy and pathogenicity of *Ceratocystis* species on *Eucalyptus* trees in South China, including *C. chinaeucensis* sp. nov. Fungal Divers. 58, 267–279.
- Collemare, J., Billard, A., Böhnert, H.U., Lebrun, M.-H., 2008. Biosynthesis of secondary metabolites in the rice blast fungus *Magnaporthe grisea*: the role of hybrid PKS-NRPS in pathogenicity. Mycol. Res. 112, 207–215.
- Cumagun, C.J.R., Bowden, R.L., Jurgenson, J.E., Leslie, J.F., Miedaner, T., 2004. Genetic mapping of pathogenicity and aggressiveness of *Gibberella zeae* (*Fusarium graminearum*) toward wheat. Phytopathology 94, 520–526.
- Dalman, K., Himmelstrand, K., Olson Å, Lind, M., Brandström-Durling, M., Stenlid, J., 2013. A genome-wide association study identifies genomic regions for virulence in the non-model organism *Heterobasidion annosum s.s.* PLoS One 8 e53525.
- De Beer, Z.W., Duong, T.A., Barnes, I., Wingfield, B.D., Wingfield, M.J., 2014. Redefining *Ceratocystis* and allied genera. Stud. Mycol. 79, 187–219.
- De Mendiburu, F., 2014. Agricolae: statistical procedures for agricultural research. R package version 1.
- De Vos, L, Van der Nest, M.A., Van der Merwe, N.A., Myburg, A.A., Wingfield, M.J., Wingfield, B.D., 2011. Genetic analysis of growth, morphology and pathogenicity in the F1 progeny of an interspecific cross between *Fusarium circinatum* and *Fusarium subglutinans*. Fungal Biol. 115, 902–908.
- Deng, C.H., Plummer, K.M., Jones, D.A.B., Mesarich, C.H., Shiller, J., Taranto, A.P., Robinson, A.J., Kastner, P., Hall, N.E., Templeton, M.D., Bowen, J.K., 2017. Comparative analysis of the predicted secretomes of Rosaceae scab pathogens *Venturia inaequalis* and *V. pirina* reveals expanded effector families and putative determinants of host range. BMC Genom. 18, 339.
- Engelbrecht, C.J.B., Harrington, T.C., 2005. Intersterility, morphology and taxonomy of *Ceratocystis fimbriata* on sweet potato, cacao and sycamore. Mycologia 97, 57–69.

- Ferreira, E.M., Harrington, T.C., Thorpe, D.J., Alfenas, A.C., 2010. Genetic diversity and interfertility among highly differentiated populations of *Ceratocystis fimbriata* in Brazil. Plant Pathol. 59, 721–735.
- Fourie, A., Wingfield, M., Wingfield, B., Barnes, I., 2014. Molecular markers delimit cryptic species in *Ceratocystis sensu stricto*. Mycol. Prog. 14, 1–18.
- Fourie, A., Wingfield, M.J., Wingfield, B.D., Thu, P.Q., Barnes, I., 2016. A possible centre of diversity in South East Asia for the tree pathogen, *Ceratocystis manginecans*. Infect. Genet. Evol. 41, 73–83.
- Fox, J., Weisberg, S., 2011. An R Companion to Applied Regression-2nd Edition. SAGE Publications Ltd, Thousand Oaks, California.
- Gao, Y., Liu, Z., Faris, J.D., Richards, C., Brueggeman, R.S., Li, X., Oliver, R.P., McDonald, B.A., Friesen, T.L., 2016. Validation of genome-wide association studies as a tool to identify virulence factors in *Parastagonospora nodorum*. Phytopathology 106, 1177–1185.
- Halsted, B.D., 1890. Some fungous diseases of the sweet potato. N.J. Agric. Coll. Exp. Stn. Bull. 76, 1–32.
- Harrington, T.C., Huang, Q., Ferreira, M.A., Alfenas, A.C., 2014. Genetic analyses trace the Yunnan, China population of *Ceratocystis fimbriata* on pomegranate and taro to populations on *Eucalyptus* in Brazil. Plant Dis. 99, 106–111.
- Harrington, T.C., McNew, D.L., 1997. Self fertility and uni-directional mating-type switching in *Ceratocystis coerulescens*, a filamentous ascomycete. Curr. Genet. 32, 52–59.
- Harrington, T.C., McNew, D.L., 1998. Partial interfertility among the *Ceratocystis* species on conifers. Fungal Genet. Biol. 25, 44–53.
- Harrington, T.C., Thorpe, D.J., Alfenas, A.C., 2011. Genetic variation and variation in aggressiveness to native and exotic hosts among Brazilian populations of *Ceratocystis fimbriata*. Phytopathol. 101, 555–566.
- Huang, Q., Zhu, Y.Y., Chen, H.R., Wang, Y.Y., Liu, Y.L., Lu, W.J., Ruan, X.Y., 2003. First report of pomegranate wilt caused by *Ceratocystis fimbriata* in Yunnan, China. Plant Dis. 87, 1150–1150.
- Ishida, H., Suzuno, H., Sugiyama, N., Innami, S., Tadokoro, T., Maekawa, A., 2000. Nutritive evaluation on chemical components of leaves, stalks and stems of sweet potatoes (*Ipomoea batatas poir*). Food Chem. 68, 359–367.
- Johnson, J.A., Harrington, T.C., Engelbrecht, C.J.B., 2005. Phylogeny and taxonomy of the North American clade of the *Ceratocystis fimbriata* complex. Mycologia 97, 1067–1092.
- Kao, K.C., Schwartz, K., Sherlock, G., 2010. A genome-wide analysis reveals no nuclear Dobzhansky-Muller pairs of determinants of speciation between *S. cerevisiae* and *S. paradoxus*, but suggests more complex incompatibilities. PLoS Genet. 6, e1001038.
- Kile, G., Brasier, C., 1990. Inheritance and inter-relationship of fitness characters in progeny of an aggressive \times non-aggressive cross of *Ophiostoma ulmi*. Mycol. Res. 94, 514–522.
- Kile, G.A., Harrington, T.C., Yuan, Z.Q., Dudzinski, M.J., Old, K.M., 1996. *Ceratocystis eucalypti* sp. nov., a vascular stain fungus from eucalypts in Australia. Mycol. Res. 100, 571–579.
- Kojima, M., Uritani, I., 1976. Possible involvement of furanoterpenoid phytoalexins in establishing host-parasite specificity between sweet potato and various strains of *Ceratocystis fimbriata*. Physiol. Plant Pathol. 8, 97–111.
- Langfelder, K., Streibel, M., Jahn, B., Haase, G., Brakhage, A.A., 2003. Biosynthesis of fungal melanins and their importance for human pathogenic fungi. Fungal Genet. Biol. 38, 143–158.
- Lannou, C., 2011. Variation and selection of quantitative traits in plant pathogens. Annu. Rev. Phytopathol. 50, 319–338.
- Lê, S., Josse, J., Husson, F., 2008. FactoMineR: an R package for multivariate analysis. J. Stat. Softw. 25, 1–18.
- Lee, D.H., Roux, J., Wingfield, B.D., Wingfield, M.J., 2015. Variation in growth rates and aggressiveness of naturally occurring self-fertile and self-sterile isolates of the wilt pathogen *Ceratocystis albifundus*. Plant Pathol. 64, 1103–1109.
- Lendenmann, M.H., Croll, D., Stewart, E.L., McDonald, B.A., 2014. Quantitative trait locus mapping of melanization in the plant pathogenic fungus *Zymoseptoria tritici.* G3 Genes Genom. Genet. 4, 2519–2533.
- Lenth, R.V., 2016. Least-squares means: the R package Ismeans. J. Stat. Softw. 69, 1–33.
- Li, Q., Harrington, T.C., McNew, D., Li, J., Huang, Q., Somasekhara, Y.M., Alfenas, A.C., 2016. Genetic bottlenecks for two populations of *Ceratocystis fimbriata* on sweet potato and pomegranate in China. Plant Dis. 100, 2266–2274.
- Lin, X., Huang, J.C., Mitchell, T.G., Heitman, J., 2006. Virulence attributes and hyphal growth of *C. neoformans* are quantitative traits and the *MAT* α allele enhances filamentation. PLoS Genet. 2, e187.
- Lind, M., Dalman, K., Stenlid, J., Karlsson, B., Olson Å, 2007. Identification of quantitative trait loci affecting virulence in the basidiomycete *Heterobasidion* annosum s.l. Curr. Genet. 52, 35–44.
- Marin-Felix, Y., Groenewald, J.Z., Cai, L., Chen, Q., Marincowitz, S., Barnes, I., Bensch, K., Braun, U., Camporesi, E., Damm, U., De Beer, Z.W., Dissanayake, A., Edwards, J., Giraldo, A., Hernández-Restrepo, M., Hyde, K.D., Jayawardena, R.S., Lombard, L., Luangsa-ard, J., McTaggart, A.R., Rossman, A.Y., Sandoval-Denis, M., Shen, M., Shivas, R.G., Tan, Y.P., Van der Linde, E.J., Wingfield, M.J., Wood, A.R., Zhang, J.Q., Zhang, Y., Crous, P.W., 2017. Genera of phytopathogenic fungi: GOPHY 1. Stud. Mycol. 86, 99–216.
- Milus, E.A., Kristensen, K., Hovmøller, M.S., 2008. Evidence for increased aggressiveness in a recent widespread strain of *Puccinia striiformis f. sp. tritici* causing stripe rust of wheat. Phytopathology 99, 89–94.
- Molano, E.P.L., Cabrera, O.G., Jose, J., do Nascimento, L.C., Carazzolle, M.F., Teixeira, P.J.P.L., Alvarez, J.C., Tiburcio, R.A., Tokimatu Filho, P.M., de Lima, G.M.A.,

A. Fourie et al. / Fungal Biology xxx (2018) 1-13

Guido, R.V.C., Corrêa, T.L.R., Leme, A.F.P., Mieczkowski, P., Pereira, G.A.G., 2018. Ceratocystis cacaofunesta genome analysis reveals a large expansion of extracellular phosphatidylinositol-specific phospholipase-C genes (PI-PLC), BMC Genom. 19, 58.

- Murakami, J., Tomita, R., Kataoka, T., Nakayashiki, H., Tosa, Y., Mayama, S., 2003. Analysis of host species specificity of Magnaporthe grisea toward foxtail millet using a genetic cross between isolates from wheat and foxtail millet. Phytopathology 93, 42-45.
- Murakami, J., Tosa, Y., Kataoka, T., Tomita, R., Kawasaki, J., Chuma, I., Sesumi, Y., Kusaba, M., Nakayashiki, H., Mayama, S., 2000. Analysis of host species specificity of Magnaporthe grisea toward wheat using a genetic cross between isolates from wheat and foxtail millet. Phytopathology 90, 1060-1067.
- Oliveira, L.S.S., Guimarães, L.M.S., Ferreira, M.A., Nunes, A.S., Pimenta, L.V.A., Alfenas, A.C., 2015a. Aggressiveness, cultural characteristics and genetic variation of Ceratocystis fimbriata on Eucalyptus spp. For. Pathol. 45, 505–514. Oliveira, L.S.S., Harrington, T.C., Ferreira, M.A., Damacena, M.B., Al-Sadi, A.M., Al-
- Mahmooli, I.H.S., Alfenas, A.C., 2015b. Species or genotypes? Reassessment of four recently described species of the Ceratocystis wilt pathogen, *Ceratocystis* fimbriata, on Mangifera indica. Phytopathology 105, 1229-1244.
- Olson, Å., Lind, M., Stenlid, L. 2005, In vitro test of virulence in the progeny of a *Heterobasidion* interspecific cross. Forest Pathol. 35, 321–331. Pariaud, B., Robert, C., Goyeau, H., Lannou, C., 2009. Aggressiveness components and
- adaptation to a host cultivar in wheat leaf rust. Phytopathology 99, 869-878.
- Shirke, M.D., Mahesh, H.B., Gowda, M., 2016. Genome-wide comparison of Magnaporthe Species reveals a host-specific pattern of secretory proteins and transposable elements. PLoS One 11, e0162458.
- Stewart, E.L., Croll, D., Lendenmann, M.H., Sanchez-Vallet, A., Hartmann, F.E., Palma-Guerrero, J., Ma, X., McDonald, B., 2016. QTL mapping reveals complex genetic architecture of quantitative virulence in the wheat pathogen Zymoseptoria tritici. bioRxiv. https://doi.org/10.1101/051169.
- Stewart, E.L., McDonald, B.A., 2014. Measuring quantitative virulence in the wheat pathogen Zymoseptoria tritici using high-throughput automated image analysis. Phytopathology 104, 985–992.
- Stukenbrock, E.H., 2013. Evolution, selection and isolation: a genomic view of speciation in fungal plant pathogens. New Phytol. 199, 895-907.
- Talas, F., Kalih, R., Miedaner, T., McDonald, B.A., 2016. Genome-wide association study identifies novel candidate genes for aggressiveness, deoxynivalenol production, and azole sensitivity in natural field populations of Fusarium graminearum. Mol. Plant Microbe Interact. 29, 417-430.
- Tarigan, M., Roux, J., Van Wyk, M., Tjahjono, B., Wingfield, M.J., 2011. A new wilt and die-back disease of Acacia mangium associated with Ceratocystis manginecans and C. acaciivora sp. nov. in Indonesia. SA. J. Bot. 77, 292-304.
- Tosa, Y., Tamba, H., Tanaka, K., Mayama, S., 2006. Genetic analysis of host species specificity of Magnaporthe oryzae isolates from rice and wheat. Phytopathology 96. 480-484.
- Trang, T.T., Eyles, A., Davies, N., Glen, M., Ratkowsky, D., Mohammed, C., 2017. Screening for host responses in Acacia to a canker and wilt pathogen, Ceratocystis manginecans. Forest Pathol. 48 e12390.

- Tsopelas, P., Santini, A., Wingfield, M.J., De Beer, Z.W., 2017. Canker stain: a lethal disease destroying iconic plane trees. Plant Dis. 101, 645-658.
- Van den Brink, J., De Vries, R.P., 2011. Fungal enzyme sets for plant polysaccharide degradation. Appl. Microbiol. Biotechnol. 91, 1477-1492.
- Van der Nest, M.A., Slippers, B., Steenkamp, E.T., De Vos, L., Van Zyl, K., Stenlid, J., Wingfield, M.J., Wingfield, B.D., 2009. Genetic linkage map for Amylostereum areolatum reveals an association between vegetative growth and sexual and self-recognition. Fungal Genet. Biol. 46, 632-641.
- Van der Nest, M.A., Steenkamp, E.T., McTaggart, A.R., Trollip, C., Godlonton, T., Sauerman, E., Roodt, D., Naidoo, K., Coetzee, M.P.A., Wilken, P.M., Wingfield, M.J., Wingfield, B.D., 2015. Saprophytic and pathogenic fungi in the Ceratocystidaceae differ in their ability to metabolize plant-derived sucrose. BMC Evol. Biol. 15, 273.
- Van Wyk, M., Roux, J., Barnes, I., Wingfield, B.D., Chhetri, D.B., Kirisits, T., Wingfield, M.J., 2004. Ceratocystis bhutanensis sp. nov., associated with the bark beetle *Ips schmutzenhoferi* on *Picea spinulosa* in Bhutan. Stud. Mycol. 50, 365 - 379
- Van Wyk, M., Wingfield, B., Wingfield, M., 2013. Ceratocystis species in the Ceratocystis fimbriata complex. In: Seifert, K.A., De Beer, Z.W., Wingfield, M.J. (Eds.), The Ophiostomatoid Fungi: Expanding Frontiers, 12 Edn. CBS Biodiversity Series. CBS-KNAW Fungal Biodiversity Centre, Utrecht, The Netherlands, pp. 65-73.
- Wadke, N., Kandasamy, D., Vogel, H., Lah, L., Wingfield, B.D., Paetz, C., Wright, L.P., Gershenzon, J., Hammerbacher, A., 2016. The bark-beetle-associated fungus, Endoconidiophora polonica, utilizes the phenolic defense compounds of its host as a carbon source. Plant Physiol. 171, 914-931.
- Webster, R.K., 1967. The inheritance of sexuality, color and colony type in Ceratocystis fimbriata. Mycologia 59, 222-234.
- Webster, R.K., Butler, E.E., 1967. The origin of self-sterile, cross-fertile strains and culture sterility in Ceratocystis fimbriata. Mycologia 59, 212–221.
- Wilken, P.M., 2015. Mating in Ceratocystis, Department of Genetics. University of Pretoria.
- Wilken, P.M., Steenkamp, E.T., Wingfield, M.J., De Beer, Z.W., Wingfield, B.D., 2014. DNA Loss at the Ceratocystis fimbriata mating locus results in self-sterility. PLoS One 9, e92180.
- Wingfield, M.J., Roux, J., Wingfield, B.D., Slippers, B., 2013. Ceratocystis and Ophiostoma: international spread, new associations and plant health. In: Seifert, K.A., De Beer, W., Wingfield, M.J. (Eds.), Ophiostomatoid Fungi: Expanding Frontiers, 12 edn. CBS-KNAW Fungal Biodiversity Centre, Utrecht, Netherlands, pp. 191-200.
- Witthuhn, R.C., Harrington, T.C., Steimel, J.P., Wingfield, B.D., Wingfield, M.J., 2000. Comparison of isozymes, rDNA spacer regions and MAT-2 DNA sequences as phylogenetic characters in the analysis of the Ceratocystis coerulescens complex. Mycologia 92, 447-452.
- Zhan, F., Xie, Y., Zhu, W., Sun, D.L., McDonald, B.A., Zhan, J., 2016. Linear correlation analysis of Zymoseptoria tritici aggressiveness with in vitro growth rate. Phytopathology 106, 1255-1261.